Growth and Opportunity Impact Assessment

2017

Summary of Findings:
Northeast Ohio
Contents

• Impact Assessment: Goals and Process

• Observations and Findings:
  • Job Creation
  • Job Preparation
  • Job Access

• What’s Next?
Fund grantees regularly surpassed jobs, payroll and capital goals

Fund Job Creation Grantees
2004-2016

Primary Grantees:

Team NEO
Bio Enterprise
Magnet
Jumpstart
But we wondered how this work advanced the rest of our strategy

- Do these jobs pay family-sustaining wages?
- Are we creating job opportunities for Northeast Ohio residents with PhDs as well as those with GEDs?
- Can residents without a car get to where these jobs are located?
We used data and local community feedback to explore this question

Data
- Grantee outcomes
- Broader economy-wide data

Local Community Engagement
- Mahoning Valley
- Akron
- Cleveland
- Lorain

Goals
- Improve grantmaking impact
- Calibrate knowledge of “what matters”
- Develop shared language and understanding with local partners
Contents

• Impact Assessment: Goals and Process

• Observations and Findings:
  • Job Creation
  • Job Preparation
  • Job Access

• What’s Next?
Job Creation: Summary of Findings

1. Traded-sector growth is fundamental to the long-term economic health of the region.

2. The Fund’s job creation grantmaking outcomes are primarily within the traded sector, a reflection of the Fund’s historic grantmaking strategy.
Traded-sector growth is critical for the economic health of the region

**Traded Sector:** Companies with customers outside local economy (e.g., manufacturing, professional services); distinct from “population-serving” businesses

**Wages**
- **$69k:** traded sector
- **$32k:** local serving

**Spill-over**
- 2.4 jobs added for every new traded job
- 0.5 jobs added for every new local-serving job

**Accessible**

Opportunities exist for college educated as well as high school educated workers

---

1: Based on EMSI average annual wages in 18-county NEO; 2: Based on EMSI calculations for direct jobs added in 18-county NEO; 3: Educational accessibility of jobs in this sector will be discussed in greater detail in subsequent slides
Job creation grantee efforts concentrated in traded sector

Grantee job creation outcomes by sector vs. overall economy
Percentage of jobs by sector; top 25 fastest-growing industries; 2010-2016

Source: Grantee-reported outcomes; EMSI
Contents

• Impact Assessment: Goals and Process

• Observations and Findings:
  • Job Creation
  • Job Preparation
  • Job Access

• What’s Next?
Job Preparation: Summary of Findings

Guiding Questions

Beyond understanding the traditional jobs, payroll and capital metrics, we also asked ourselves:

1. Fund grantees are helping to create jobs along the “GED to PhD” spectrum
   • These jobs also pay living wages much more regularly than jobs being created in the economy overall

2. Removing barriers to employment (i.e., language barriers) and increasing access to support services is critical for expanding access to opportunity.

   - What are the educational attainment requirements to hold jobs in the traded sector?
   - Do jobs in this sector tend to pay family-sustaining, living wages?
   - What other barriers prevent or limit a resident’s participation in the economy?
Some sectors are creating accessible, living-wage jobs

Educational attainment requirements and average wages by industry
Top 25 growing industries from 2010-2016; 18-county NEO; bubble size based on job growth

Especially true in the office/professional and industrial industries, both of which are in traded sector

Source: EMSI
Fund job creation grantee outcomes:

Many jobs do not require 4-year degree; nearly all pay living wage

Educational attainment requirements and average wages by industry
FFEFE grantees; top 25 industries by 2010-2016 job growth; 18-county NEO

Source: Average educational attainment requirements by industry from EMSI; average salary per job as reported by grantees based on jobs and payroll
Accessible support services are critical for increasing access to opportunity

Presence of many different services can significantly help residents get and persist in quality jobs:

- Access to food (example at right)
- Access to childcare
- Assistance w/criminal backgrounds
- Driver’s licenses
- Assistance w/language barriers
- Etc.

Source: College of Wooster AMRE Transportation Project Mapping Guide
Contents

• Impact Assessment: Goals and Process

• Observations and Findings:
  • Job Creation
  • Job Preparation
  • Job Access

• What’s Next?
Job Access: Summary of Findings

1. Northeast Ohio is one of the worst places in the country when it comes to growing jobs close to where people live.

2. This geographic disconnect can be seen by observing where growing and shrinking job hubs are located across the region.
Across NEO, jobs are moving farther from residents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Change in Number of Jobs Near Average Resident: 2000 - 2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown</td>
<td>-13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akron</td>
<td>-14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>-27%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Northeast Ohio metros are among worst in country when it comes to number of jobs near average resident

Source: “The growing distance between people and jobs in metropolitan America,” The Brookings Institution, May 2015; Measured by number of jobs within the median commute distance of the center point of each census tract. Median commute based on Cleveland MSA commuting patterns.
Regional job hub growth patterns illustrate the job access issue

Northeast Ohio: Traded-sector Job Hubs
Change in traded-sector jobs from 2002-2014

Source: LODES 2014 Census Data
Contents

• Impact Assessment: Goals and Process
• Observations and Findings:
  • Job Creation
  • Job Preparation
  • Job Access
• What’s Next?
The findings from this work are influencing our Fund’s strategy.

We are exploring many new initiatives as a result of this work. Examples include:

1. Where are new opportunities to support traded-sector growth and/or cluster development?

2. How can we better understand the economic impact of re-entry requirements for people with criminal records?

3. Can mobility solutions like ride-sharing and on-demand transportation help address the job access challenge?
The findings also helped clarify our definition of an inclusive economy

An inclusive economy is...

A continuously regenerating economy...

...creating good jobs and rising incomes...

...for everyone.

- Traded-sector job growth
- Growth in young firms
- Rising prosperity (productivity, wages, standard of living)
- Full employment
- Economic security (living wage)
- Reducing racial disparity (employment, income, and living wage)
- Reducing concentrations of economic distress